CHAIM STEINBERGER, P.C.

ATTORNEYS AT LAW

150 EAST 58TH STREET, SUITE 2701

NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10155

(212) 964-6100 FAX (212) 500-7559

www.theNewYorkDivorceLawyers.com admin@tnydl.com

Ethical Rules and Considerations Relating to Blog Posts

Sources of Relevant authority:

New York Rules of Professional Conduct ("RPC");

NYSBA Op. 1009;

Federal Controlling the Assault of Non-Solicited Pornography and Marketing Act of 2003 ("CAN-SPAM Act");

Federal Trade Commission rules, 16 C.F.R. 316;

Alexander v. Cahill, 598 F.3d 79 (2d Cir., 2010), *cert. den., Cahill v. Alexander*, 562 US 1123, 131 S.Ct. 820 (12/13/2010);

Beware, a lawyer's email campaign may be considered an "advertisement" and subject to all of the rules governing attorney advertising, or a "solicitation [for business]") which would make it subject to a whole additional lever of regulation. If your email-blast goes out to specific addressees in relation to a specific occurrence, it is a "solicitation."

For additional information or clarification, see also:

NYSBA Commercial & Federal Litigation Section's excellent compendium, *Social Media Ethics Guidelines*, available for download at http://www.nysba.org/socialmediaguidelines/.

New York City Bar Commentary on New York's Ethics Rules Governing Lawyer Advertising & Solicitation, available for download at http://www.nycbar.org/pdf/report/Commentary NY%20Ethics RUles.pdf.

Blog Ethics-Worksheet:

- ♦ Is the communication directed to existing clients or other lawyers? If yes, then it's <u>not</u> an advertisement. NYRPC 1.0(a)
- ♦ Is the "primary purpose" of the communication "for the retention of the lawyer," R.1.0(a), rather than education?

Consider 3 factors (New York State Bar Ass'n Comm. on Prof'l Ethics ("NYSBA") Op. 848 (2010)):

1

(i) the *intent* of the communication;

including the name & contact info, i.e., general awareness and branding, isn't advertising.

(ii) the content of the communication; and

Topical newsletters, client alerts, or blogs intended to educate recipients about new developments in the law are generally not considered advertising.

However, a newsletter, client alert, or blog that provides information or news primarily about the lawyer or law firm (for example, the lawyer or law firm's cases, personnel, clients or achievements) generally would be considered advertising. (R.7.1 Cmt.7)

(iii) the targeted audience of the communication.

To clients, other lawyers, or prior clients germane to their representation, is not advertising.

If, considering the *intent* and *content*, it seems like an advertisement, then consider the *targeted audience*.

If you determine that it's an advertisement, then, per R. 7.1(f), include the label "Attorney Advertising."

- ♦ Does the communication include, R.7.1(d):
 - (1) statements that are reasonably likely to create an expectation about results the lawyer can achieve;
 - (2) statements that compare the lawyer's services with the services of other lawyers;
 - (3) testimonials or endorsements of clients, and of former clients; or
 - (4) statements describing or characterizing the quality of the lawyer's or law firm's services.

then you must ensure that, R.7.1(e):

. . . .

- (2) it can be factually supported . . . as of the date . . . published or disseminated;
- (3) it is accompanied by the "Prior results do not guarantee a similar outcome" notice; and
- (4) [if] the . . . testimonial or endorsement [regards] a matter still pending, the client gives informed consent confirmed in writing.
- ♦ [A] lawyer may speak publicly or write for publication on legal topics so long as the lawyer does not undertake to give individual advice. (NYRPC 7.1 (r)). That is, I can provide general answers to legal questions, but I should not provide specific legal advice on a social media network because that might create an attorney-client relationship and the advice I post may impermissibly disclose privileged or confidential information. Guideline 3.A. (Remember also that client communications, even through social media platforms, must be retained like all other client communications. Guideline 3.C.)
- ♦ A LinkedIn profile that contains more than biographical and education information, and might "include[] subjective statements regarding an attorney's skills, areas of practice, endorsements, or testimonials from clients or colleagues," is likely "advertising" and should contain the "Attorney Advertising" designation and, because the endorsements and statements about the lawyer's qualifications likely fall into the

category(ies) of: (1) statements that are reasonably likely to create an expectation about results the lawyer can achieve; (2) statements that compare the lawyer's services with the services of other lawyers; (3) testimonials or endorsements of clients; or (4) statements describing or characterizing the quality of the lawyer's or law firm's services, the attorney should also include the disclaimer "Prior results do not guarantee a similar outcome." NYSBA Comm'l & Fed. Lit. Section, *Social Media Ethics Guidelines*, Guideline 2 (2015) (*quoting* New York County Lawyers' Association ("NYCLA"), Formal Op. 748 (2015).)

- ♦ **Twitter**'s 140-character limit may prevent including these required statements; so make sure you don't tweet anything that might be considered advertising. *Id*.
- "[A]ll advertisements shall be pre-approved by the lawyer," NYRPC 7.1(k), so don't let anyone else send advertisement-posts from your account or on your behalf.
- ♦ Advertisements must be maintained for three years; computer advertisements for one. NYRPC 7.1(k).
- ♦ If a post is a "solicitation" directed to a New York resident, it is subject to the filing requirements. NYRPC 7.3(c).
- If an unrelated party posts to my website something that would violate the rules, I must remove it, or ask the person to remove it. Guideline 2.C. I must also ensure the accuracy of third-party endorsements. Guideline 2.D.
- A lawyer *may not provide legal advice* via social media; only general information. NY RPC 7.1(r) ("Without affecting the right to accept employment, a lawyer may speak publicly or write for publication on legal topics so long as the lawyer does not undertake to give individual advice.")

CHAIM STEINBERGER, P.C.

ATTORNEYS AT LAW
150 EAST 58TH STREET, SUITE 2701
NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10155
(212) 964-6100

FAX (212) 500-7559

www.theNewYorkDivorceLawyers.com

admin@tnydl.com

Disclosure Best Practices Checklist 1:

Disclosure of Identity

Focus: Best practices for how employees and agencies acting as official corporate representatives disclose their identity when using social media. For more, or further clarification, *see*, http://socialmedia.org/disclosure/.

When communicating via social media on behalf of our company or on topics related to the business of our company, we will:

- 1. Disclose who we are, who we work for, and any other relevant affiliations from the very first encounter.
- 2. Disclose any business/client relationship if we are communicating on behalf of another party.
- 3. Ensure that all disclosure meets the minimum legal standard by being a) clear and conspicuous, b) understandable by the average reader, and c) clearly visible within the relevant content.
- 4. Require all employees to disclose their employer when using social media to communicate on behalf of the company or about company-related topics.
- 5. Make certain that disclosure is sufficient so that the average reader understands that our company is responsible for the content, while they are reading the content.
- 6. Comply with all laws and regulations regarding disclosure of identity.
- 7. Properly use pseudonyms and role accounts:
 - a. (Option A) Never use a false or obscured identity or pseudonym.
 - b. (Option B) If aliases or role accounts are used for employee privacy,

security, or other business reasons, these identities will clearly indicate the organization represented and provide means for two-way communications with that alias.

- 8. Provide a means of communicating with our company in order to verify our involvement in a particular item of social media content.
- 9. Instruct all employees, agencies, and advocates with whom we have a formal relationship on these disclosure policies and require them to comply.

CHAIM STEINBERGER, P.C.

ATTORNEYS AT LAW

150 EAST 58TH STREET, SUITE 2701

NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10155

(212) 964-6100 FAX (212) 500-7559

www.theNewYorkDivorceLawyers.com admin@tnydl.com

The following provisions of New York's *Rules of Professional Conduct* ("RPC") relate to attorney advertising and social media. (These Rules incorporate the 2015 amendments to the RPC.)

Rule 1.0: Terminology.

(a) "Advertisement" means any public or private communication made by or on behalf of a lawyer or law firm about that lawyer or law firm's services, the primary purpose of which is for the retention of the lawyer or law firm. It does not include communications to existing clients or other lawyers.

. . . .

(c) "Computer-accessed communication" means any communication made by or on behalf of a lawyer or law firm that is disseminated through the use of a computer or related electronic device, including, but not limited to, web sites, weblogs, search engines, electronic mail, banner advertisements, pop-up and pop-under advertisements, chat rooms, list servers, instant messaging, or other internet presences, and any attachments or links related thereto.

. . . .

(e) "Confirmed in writing" denotes (i) a writing from the person to the lawyer confirming that the person has given consent, (ii) a writing that the lawyer promptly transmits to the person confirming the person's oral consent, or (iii) a statement by the person made on the record of any proceeding before a tribunal. If it is not feasible to obtain or transmit the writing at the time the person gives oral consent, then the lawyer must obtain or transmit it within a reasonable time thereafter.

• • • •

- (h) "Firm" or "law firm" includes, but is not limited to, a lawyer or lawyers in a law partnership, professional corporation, sole proprietorship or other association authorized to practice law; or lawyers employed in a qualified legal assistance organization, a government law office, or the legal department of a corporation or other organization.
- (i) "Fraud" or "fraudulent" denotes conduct that is fraudulent under the substantive or procedural law of the applicable jurisdiction or has a purpose to deceive, provided that it does not include conduct that, although characterized as fraudulent by statute or administrative rule, lacks an element of scienter, deceit, intent to mislead, or knowing failure to correct misrepresentations that can be reasonably expected to induce detrimental reliance by another.
 - (j) "Informed consent" denotes the agreement by a person to a proposed course of

conduct after the lawyer has communicated information adequate for the person to make an informed decision, and after the lawyer has adequately explained to the person the material risks of the proposed course of conduct and reasonably available alternatives.

. . . .

(x) "Writing" or "written" denotes a tangible or electronic record of a communication or representation, including handwritting, typewriting, printing, photocopying, photography, audio or video recording and email. A "signed" writing includes an electronic sound, symbol or process attached to or logically associated with a writing and executed or adopted by a person with the intent to sign the writing.

R 7.1. Advertising

- (a) A lawyer or law firm shall not use or disseminate or participate in the use or dissemination of any advertisement that:
 - (1) contains statements or claims that are false, deceptive or misleading; or
 - (2) violates a Rule.
- (b) Subject to the provisions of paragraph (a), an advertisement may include information as to:
 - (1) legal and nonlegal education, degrees and other scholastic distinctions, dates of admission to any bar; areas of the law in which the lawyer or law firm practices, as authorized by these Rules; public offices and teaching positions held; publications of law-related matters authored by the lawyer; memberships in bar associations or other professional societies or organizations, including offices and committee assignments therein; foreign language fluency; and bona fide professional ratings;
 - (2) names of clients regularly represented, provided that the client has given prior written consent;
 - (3) bank references; credit arrangements accepted; prepaid or group legal services programs in which the lawyer or law firm participates; nonlegal services provided by the lawyer or law firm or by an entity owned and controlled by the lawyer or law firm; the existence of contractual relationships between the lawyer or law firm and a nonlegal professional or nonlegal professional service firm, to the extent permitted by Rule 5.8, and the nature and extent of services available through those contractual relationships; and
 - (4) legal fees for initial consultation; contingent fee rates in civil matters when accompanied by a statement disclosing the information required by paragraph (p); range of fees for legal and nonlegal services, provided that there be available to the public free of charge a written statement clearly describing the scope of each advertised service; hourly rates; and fixed fees for specified legal and nonlegal services.
- (c) An advertisement shall not:
 - (1) include a paid endorsement of, or a testimonial about, a lawyer or law firm without disclosing that the person is being compensated therefor;
 - (2) include the portrayal of a fictitious law firm, the use of a fictitious name to refer to lawyers not

associated together in a law firm, or otherwise imply that lawyers are associated in a law firm if that is not the case.

- (3) use actors to portray a judge, the lawyer, members of the law firm, or clients, or utilize depictions of fictionalized events or scenes, without disclosure of same; or
- (4) be made to resemble legal documents.
- (d) An advertisement that complies with subdivision paragraph (e) of this section may contain the following:
 - (1) statements that are reasonably likely to create an expectation about results the lawyer can achieve;
 - (2) statements that compare the lawyer's services with the services of other lawyers;
 - (3) testimonials or endorsements of clients, and of former clients; or
 - (4) statements describing or characterizing the quality of the lawyer's or law firm's services.
- (e) It is permissible to provide the information set forth in subdivision paragraph (d) of this section provided:
 - (1) its dissemination does not violate subdivision paragraph (a) of this section;
 - (2) it can be factually supported by the lawyer or law firm as of the date on which the advertisement is published or disseminated; and
 - (3) it is accompanied by the following disclaimer: "Prior results do not guarantee a similar outcome"; and
 - (4) in the case of a testimonial or endorsement from a client with respect to a matter still pending, the client gives informed consent confirmed in writing.
- (f) Every advertisement other than those appearing in a radio, television or billboard advertisement, in a directory, newspaper, magazine or other periodical (and any web sites related thereto), or made in person pursuant to Rule 7.3(a)(1), shall be labeled "Attorney Advertising" on the first page, or on the home page in the case of a web site. If the communication is in the form of a self-mailing brochure or postcard, the words "Attorney Advertising" shall appear therein. In the case of electronic mail, the subject line shall contain the notation "ATTORNEY ADVERTISING."
- (g) A lawyer or law firm shall not utilize meta-tags or other hidden computer codes that, if displayed, would violate these Rules.
- (h) All advertisements shall include the name, principal law office address and telephone number of the lawyer or law firm whose services are being offered.
- (i) Any words or statements required by this Rule to appear in an advertisement must be clearly legible and capable of being read by the average person, if written, and intelligible if spoken aloud. In the case of a web site, the required words or statements shall appear on the home page.
- (j) A lawyer or law firm advertising any fixed fee for specified legal services shall, at the time of fee

publication, have available to the public a written statement clearly describing the scope of each advertised service, which statement shall be available to the client at the time of retainer for any such service. Such legal services shall include all those services that are recognized as reasonable and necessary under local custom in the area of practice in the community where the services are performed.

- (k) All advertisements shall be pre-approved by the lawyer or law firm, and a copy shall be retained for a period of not less than three years following its initial dissemination. Any advertisement contained in a computer-accessed communication shall be retained for a period of not less than one year. A copy of the contents of any web site covered by this Rule shall be preserved upon the initial publication of the web site, any major web site redesign, or a meaningful and extensive content change, but in no event less frequently than once every 90 days.
- (1) If a lawyer or law firm advertises a range of fees or an hourly rate for services, the lawyer or law firm shall not charge more than the fee advertised for such services. If a lawyer or law firm advertises a fixed fee for specified legal services, or performs services described in a fee schedule, the lawyer or law firm shall not charge more than the fixed fee for such stated legal service as set forth in the advertisement or fee schedule, unless the client agrees in writing that the services performed or to be performed were not legal services referred to or implied in the advertisement or in the fee schedule and, further, that a different fee arrangement shall apply to the transaction.
- (m) Unless otherwise specified in the advertisement, if a lawyer publishes any fee information authorized under this Rule in a publication that is published more frequently than once per month, the lawyer shall be bound by any representation made therein for a period of not less than 30 days after such publication. If a lawyer publishes any fee information authorized under this Rule in a publication that is published once per month or less frequently, the lawyer shall be bound by any representation made therein until the publication of the succeeding issue. If a lawyer publishes any fee information authorized under this Rule in a publication that has no fixed date for publication of a succeeding issue, the lawyer shall be bound by any representation made therein for a reasonable period of time after publication, but in no event less than 90 days.
- (n) Unless otherwise specified, if a lawyer broadcasts any fee information authorized under this Rule, the lawyer shall be bound by any representation made therein for a period of not less than 30 days after such broadcast.
- (o) A lawyer shall not compensate or give anything of value to representatives of the press, radio, television or other communication medium in anticipation of or in return for professional publicity in a news item.
- (p) All advertisements that contain information about the fees charged by the lawyer or law firm, including those indicating that in the absence of a recovery no fee will be charged, shall comply with the provisions of *Judiciary Law §* 488(3).
- (q) A lawyer may accept employment that results from participation in activities designed to educate the public to recognize legal problems, to make intelligent selection of counsel or to utilize available legal services.
- (r) Without affecting the right to accept employment, a lawyer may speak publicly or write for publication on legal topics so long as the lawyer does not undertake to give individual advice.

R 7.3. Solicitation and recommendation of professional employment

(a) A lawyer shall not engage in solicitation:

- (1) by in-person or telephone contact, or by real-time or interactive computer accessed communication unless the recipient is a close friend, relative, former client or existing client; or (2) by any form of communication if:
 - (i) the communication or contact violates Rule 4.5, Rule 7.1(a), or paragraph (e) of this Rule;
 - (ii) the recipient has made known to the lawyer a desire not to be solicited by the lawyer;
 - (iii) the solicitation involves coercion, duress or harassment;
 - (iv) the lawyer knows or reasonably should know that the age or the physical, emotional or mental state of the recipient makes it unlikely that the recipient will be able to exercise reasonable judgment in retaining a lawyer; or
 - (v) the lawyer intends or expects, but does not disclose, that the legal services necessary to handle the matter competently will be performed primarily by another lawyer who is not affiliated with the soliciting lawyer as a partner, associate or of counsel.
- (b) For purposes of this Rule, "solicitation" means any advertisement initiated by or on behalf of a lawyer or law firm that is directed to, or targeted at, a specific recipient or group of recipients, or their family members or legal representatives, the primary purpose of which is the retention of the lawyer or law firm, and a significant motive for which is pecuniary gain. It does not include a proposal or other writing prepared and delivered in response to a specific request of a prospective client.
- (c) A solicitation directed to a recipient in this State shall be subject to the following provisions:
 - (1) A copy of the solicitation shall at the time of its dissemination be filed with the attorney

disciplinary committee of the judicial district or judicial department wherein the lawyer or law firm maintains its principal office. Where no such office is maintained, the filing shall be made in the judicial department where the solicitation is targeted. A filing shall consist of:

- (i) a copy of the solicitation;
- (ii) a transcript of the audio portion of any radio or television solicitation; and
- (iii) if the solicitation is in a language other than English, an accurate English-language translation.
- (2) Such solicitation shall contain no reference to the fact of filing.
- (3) If a solicitation is directed to a predetermined recipient, a list containing the names and addresses of all recipients shall be retained by the lawyer or law firm for a period of not less than three years following the last date of its dissemination.
- (4) Solicitations filed pursuant to this subdivision shall be open to public inspection.
- (5) The provisions of this paragraph shall not apply to:
 - (i) a solicitation directed or disseminated to a close friend, relative, or former or existing client;

- (ii) a web site maintained by the lawyer or law firm, unless the web site is designed for and directed to or targeted at a prospective client affected by an identifiable actual event or occurrence or by an identifiable prospective defendant; or
- (iii) professional cards or other announcements the distribution of which is authorized by Rule 7.5(a).
- (d) A written solicitation shall not be sent by a method that requires the recipient to travel to a location other than that at which the recipient ordinarily receives business or personal mail or that requires a signature on the part of the recipient.
- (e) No solicitation relating to a specific incident involving potential claims for personal injury or wrongful death shall be disseminated before the 30th day after the date of the incident, unless a filing must be made within 30 days of the incident as a legal prerequisite to the particular claim, in which case no unsolicited communication shall be made before the 15th day after the date of the incident.
- (f) Any solicitation made in writing or by computer-accessed communication and directed to a predetermined recipient, if prompted by a specific occurrence involving or affecting a recipient, shall disclose how the lawyer obtained the identity of the recipient and learned of the recipient's potential legal need.
- (g) If a retainer agreement is provided with any solicitation, the top of each page shall be marked "SAMPLE" in red ink in a type size equal to the largest type size used in the agreement and the words "DO NOT SIGN" shall appear on the client signature line.
- (h) Any solicitation covered by this section shall include the name, principal law office address and telephone number of the lawyer or law firm whose services are being offered.
- (i) The provisions of this Rule shall apply to a lawyer or members of a law firm not admitted to practice in this State who shall solicit retention by residents of this State.

R 7.4. Identification of practice and specialty

(a) lawyer . . . may publicly identify one or more areas of law in which the lawyer or the law firm practices, or may state that the practice of the lawyer or law firm is limited to one or more areas of law, provided that the lawyer or law firm shall not state that the lawyer or law firm is a specialist or specializes in a particular field of law, except as provided in Rule 7.4(c).

Rule 7.5: Professional notices, letterheads, and signs.

- (a) A lawyer or law firm may use internet web sites, professional cards, professional announcement cards, office signs, letterheads or similar professional notices or devices, provided the same do not violate any statute or court rule and are in accordance with Rule 7.1, including the following:
 - (1) a professional card of a lawyer identifying the lawyer by name and as a lawyer, and giving addresses, telephone numbers, the name of the law firm, and any information permitted under Rule 7.1(b) or Rule 7.4. A professional card of a law firm may also give the names of members and associates;

- (2) a professional announcement card stating new or changed associations or addresses, change of firm name, or similar matters pertaining to the professional offices of a lawyer or law firm or any nonlegal business conducted by the lawyer or law firm pursuant to Rule 5.7. It may state biographical data, the names of members of the firm and associates, and the names and dates of predecessor firms in a continuing line of succession. It may state the nature of the legal practice if permitted under Rule 7.4;
- (3) a sign in or near the office and in the building directory identifying the law office and any nonlegal business conducted by the lawyer or law firm pursuant to Rule 5.7. The sign may state the nature of the legal practice if permitted under Rule 7.4; or
- (4) a letterhead identifying the lawyer by name and as a lawyer, and giving addresses, telephone numbers, the name of the law firm, associates and any information permitted under Rule 7.1(b) or Rule 7.4. A letterhead of a law firm may also give the names of members and associates, and names and dates relating to deceased and retired members. A lawyer or law firm may be designated "Of Counsel" on a letterhead if there is a continuing relationship with a lawyer or law firm, other than as a partner or associate. A lawyer or law firm may be designated as "General Counsel" or by similar professional reference on stationery of a client if the lawyer or the firm devotes a substantial amount of professional time in the representation of that client. The letterhead of a law firm may give the names and dates of predecessor firms in a continuing line of succession.

. . .

- (e) A lawyer or law firm may utilize a domain name for an internet web site that does not include the name of the lawyer or law firm provided:
 - (1) all pages of the web site clearly and conspicuously include the actual name of the lawyer or law firm:
 - (2) the lawyer or law firm in no way attempts to engage in the practice of law using the domain name:
 - (3) the domain name does not imply an ability to obtain results in a matter; and
 - (4) the domain name does not otherwise violate these Rules.
- (f) A lawyer or law firm may utilize a telephone number which contains a domain name, nickname, moniker or motto that does not otherwise violate these Rules.

FTC FACTS for Business

The CAN-SPAM Act: A Compliance Guide for Business



o you use email in your business? The CAN-SPAM Act, a law that sets the rules for commercial email, establishes requirements for commercial messages, gives recipients the right to have you stop emailing them, and spells out tough penalties for violations.

Despite its name, the CAN-SPAM Act doesn't apply just to bulk email. It covers all commercial messages, which the law defines as "any electronic mail message the primary purpose of which is the commercial advertisement or promotion of a commercial product or service," including email that promotes content on commercial websites. The law makes no exception for business-to-business email. That means all email – for example, a message to former customers announcing a new product line – must comply with the law.

Each separate email in violation of the CAN-SPAM Act is subject to penalties of up to \$16,000, so non-compliance can be costly. But following the law isn't complicated.

Here's a rundown of CAN-SPAM's main requirements:

- **1. Don't use false or misleading header information**. Your "From," "To," "Reply-To," and routing information including the originating domain name and email address must be accurate and identify the person or business who initiated the message.
- **2. Don't use deceptive subject lines.** The subject line must accurately reflect the content of the message.
- **3. Identify the message as an ad.** The law gives you a lot of leeway in how to do this, but you must disclose clearly and conspicuously that your message is an advertisement.
- **4. Tell recipients where you're located.** Your message must include your valid physical postal address. This can be your current street address, a post office box you've registered with the U.S. Postal Service, or a private mailbox you've registered with a commercial mail receiving agency established under Postal Service regulations.
- 5. Tell recipients how to opt out of receiving future email from you. Your message must include a clear and conspicuous explanation of how the recipient can opt out of getting email from you in the future. Craft the notice in a way that's easy for an ordinary person to recognize, read, and understand. Creative use of type size, color, and location can improve clarity. Give a return email address or another easy Internet-based way to allow people to communicate their choice to you. You may create a menu to allow a recipient to opt out of certain types of messages, but you must include the option to stop all commercial messages from you. Make sure your spam filter doesn't block these opt-out requests.
- **6. Honor opt-out requests promptly.** Any opt-out mechanism you offer must be able to process opt-out requests for at least 30 days after you send your message. You must honor a recipient's opt-out request within 10 business days. You can't charge a fee, require the recipient to give you any personally identifying information beyond an email address, or make the recipient take any step other than sending a reply email or visiting a single page on an Internet website as a condition for honoring an opt-out request. Once people have told you they don't want to receive more messages from you, you can't sell or transfer their email addresses, even in the form of a mailing list. The only exception is that you may transfer the addresses to a company you've hired to help you comply with the CAN-SPAM Act.
- **7. Monitor what others are doing on your behalf.** The law makes clear that even if you hire another company to handle your email marketing, you can't contract away your legal responsibility to comply with the law. Both the company whose product is promoted in the message and the company that actually sends the message may be held legally responsible.

Need more information?

Here are the answers to some questions businesses have had about complying with the CAN-SPAM Act.

Q. How do I know if the CAN-SPAM Act covers email my business is sending?

A. What matters is the "primary purpose" of the message. To determine the primary purpose, remember that an email can contain three different types of information:

- Commercial content which advertises or promotes a commercial product or service, including content on a website operated for a commercial purpose;
- Transactional or relationship content which facilitates an already agreed-upon transaction or updates a customer about an ongoing transaction; and
- Other content which is neither commercial nor transactional or relationship.

If the message contains only commercial content, its primary purpose is commercial and it must comply with the requirements of CAM-SPAM. If it contains only transactional or relationship content, its primary purpose is transactional or relationship. In that case, it may not contain false or misleading routing information, but is otherwise exempt from most provisions of the CAN-SPAM Act.

Q. How do I know if what I'm sending is a transactional or relationship message?

A. The primary purpose of an email is transactional or relationship if it consists only of content that:

- facilitates or confirms a commercial transaction that the recipient already has agreed to;
- gives warranty, recall, safety, or security information about a product or service;
- gives information about a change in terms or features or account balance information regarding a membership, subscription, account, loan or other ongoing commercial relationship;
- provides information about an employment relationship or employee benefits; or
- delivers goods or services as part of a transaction that the recipient already has agreed to.

Q. What if the message combines commercial content and transactional or relationship content?

A. It's common for email sent by businesses to mix commercial content and transactional or relationship content. When an email contains both kinds of content, the primary purpose of the message is the deciding factor. Here's how to make that determination: If a recipient reasonably interpreting the subject line would likely conclude that the message contains an advertisement or promotion for a commercial product or service or if the message's transactional or relationship content does not appear mainly at the beginning of the message, the primary purpose of the message is commercial. So, when a message contains both kinds of content – commercial and transactional or relationship – if the subject line would lead the recipient to think it's a commercial message, it's a commercial message for CAN-SPAM purposes. Similarly, if the bulk of the transactional or relationship part of the message doesn't appear at the beginning, it's a commercial message under the CAN-SPAM Act.

Here's an example:

MESSAGE A:

TO: Jane Smith

FR: XYZ Distributing

RE: Your Account Statement

We shipped your order of 25,000 deluxe widgets to your Springfield warehouse on June 1st. We hope you received them in good working order. Please call our Customer Service Office at (877) 555-7726 if any widgets were damaged in transit. Per our contract, we must receive your payment of \$1,000 by June 30th. If not, we will impose a 10% surcharge for late payment. If you have any questions, please contact our Accounts Receivable Department.

Visit our website for our exciting new line of mini-widgets!

MESSAGE A is most likely a *transactional* or *relationship message* subject only to CAN-SPAM's requirement of truthful routing information. One important factor is that information about the customer's account is at the beginning of the message and the brief commercial portion of the message is at the end.

MESSAGE B:

TO: Jane Smith

FR: XYZ Distributing

RE: Your Account Statement

We offer a wide variety of widgets in the most popular designer colors and styles – all at low, low discount prices. Visit our website for our exciting new line of mini-widgets!

Sizzling Summer Special: Order by June 30th and all waterproof commercial-grade superwidgets are 20% off. Show us a bid from one of our competitors and we'll match it. XYZ Distributing will not be undersold.

Your order has been filled and will be delivered on Friday, June 1st.

MESSAGE B is most likely a *commercial message* subject to all CAN-SPAM's requirements. Although the subject line is "Your Account Statement" – generally a sign of a transactional or relationship message – the information at the beginning of the message is commercial in nature and the brief transactional or relationship portion of the message is at the end.

Q. What if the message combines elements of both a commercial message and a message with content defined as "other"?

A. In that case, the primary purpose of the message is commercial and the provisions of the CAN-SPAM Act apply if:

- A recipient reasonably interpreting the subject line would likely conclude that the message advertises or promotes a commercial product or service; and
- A recipient reasonably interpreting the body of the message would likely conclude that the primary purpose of the message is to advertise or promote a product or service.

Factors relevant to that interpretation include the location of the commercial content (for example, is it at the beginning of the message?); how much of the message is dedicated to commercial content; and how color, graphics, type size, style, etc., are used to highlight the commercial content.

Q. What if the email includes information from more than one company? Who is the "sender" responsible for CAN-SPAM compliance?

A. If an email advertises or promotes the goods, services, or websites of more than one marketer, there's a straightforward method for determining who's responsible for the duties the CAN-SPAM Act imposes on "senders" of commercial email. Marketers whose goods, services, or websites are advertised or promoted in a message can designate one of the marketers as the "sender" for purposes of CAN-SPAM compliance as long as the designated sender:

- meets the CAN-SPAM Act's definition of "sender," meaning that they initiate a commercial message advertising or promoting their own goods, services, or website;
- is specifically identified in the "from" line of the message; and
- complies with the "initiator" provisions of the Act for example, making sure the email does not contain deceptive transmission information or a deceptive subject heading, and ensuring that the email includes a valid postal address, a working opt-out link, and proper identification of the message's commercial or sexually explicit nature.

If the designated sender doesn't comply with the responsibilities the law gives to initiators, all marketers in the message may be held liable as senders.

Q. My company sends email with a link so that recipients can forward the message to others. Who is responsible for CAN-SPAM compliance for these "Forward to a Friend" messages?

A. Whether a seller or forwarder is a "sender" or "initiator" depends on the facts. So deciding if the CAN-SPAM Act applies to a commercial "forward-to-a-friend" message often depends on whether the seller has offered to pay the forwarder or give the forwarder some other benefit. For example, if the seller offers money, coupons, discounts, awards, additional entries in a sweepstakes, or the like in exchange for forwarding a message, the seller may be responsible for compliance. Or if a seller pays or give a benefit to someone in exchange for generating traffic to a website or for any form of referral, the seller is likely to have compliance obligations under the CAN-SPAM Act.

Q. What are the penalties for violating the CAN-SPAM Act?

A. Each separate email in violation of the law is subject to penalties of up to \$16,000, and more than one person may be held responsible for violations. For example, both the company whose product is promoted in the message and the company that originated the message may be legally responsible. Email that makes misleading claims about products or services also may be subject to laws outlawing deceptive advertising, like Section 5 of the FTC Act. The CAN-SPAM Act has certain aggravated violations that may give rise to additional fines. The law provides for criminal penalties – including imprisonment – for:

- accessing someone else's computer to send spam without permission,
- using false information to register for multiple email accounts or domain names,
- relaying or retransmitting multiple spam messages through a computer to mislead others about the origin of the message,
- harvesting email addresses or generating them through a dictionary attack (the practice of sending email to addresses made up of random letters and numbers in the hope of reaching valid ones), and
- taking advantage of open relays or open proxies without permission.

Q. Are there separate rules that apply to sexually explicit email?

A. Yes, and the FTC has issued a rule under the CAN-SPAM Act that governs these messages. Messages with sexually oriented material must include the warning "SEXUALLY-EXPLICIT:" at the beginning of the subject line. In addition, the rule requires the electronic equivalent of a "brown paper wrapper" in the body of the message. When a recipient opens the message, the only things that may be viewable on the recipient's screen are:

- the words "SEXUALLY-EXPLICIT:"; and
- the same information required in any other commercial email: a disclosure that the message is an ad, the sender's physical postal address, and the procedure for how recipients can opt out of receiving messages from this sender in the future.

No graphics are allowed on the "brown paper wrapper." This provision makes sure that recipients cannot view sexually explicit content without an affirmative act on their part – for example, scrolling down or clicking on a link. However, this requirement does not apply if the person receiving the message has already given affirmative consent to receive the sender's sexually oriented messages.

Q. How can I comment about the effect of the CAN-SPAM Act on my business?

A. The National Small Business Ombudsman collects comments from small businesses about federal compliance and enforcement activities. To comment, call 1-888-REG-FAIR (1-888-734-3247) or visit www.sba.gov/ombudsman.

For More Information

The FTC works for the consumer to prevent fraudulent, deceptive, and unfair business practices in the marketplace and to provide information to help consumers spot, stop, and avoid them. To file a complaint or to get free information on consumer issues, visit ftc.gov or call toll-free, 1-877-FTC-HELP (1-877-382-4357); TTY: 1-866-653-4261. The FTC enters consumer complaints into the Consumer Sentinel Network, a secure online database and investigative tool used by hundreds of civil and criminal law enforcement agencies in the U.S. and abroad.

Your Opportunity to Comment

The National Small Business Ombudsman and 10 Regional Fairness Boards collect comments from small businesses about federal compliance and enforcement activities. Each year, the Ombudsman evaluates the conduct of these activities and rates each agency's responsiveness to small businesses. Small businesses can comment to the Ombudsman without fear of reprisal. To comment, call toll-free 1-888-REGFAIR (1-888-734-3247) or go to www.sba.gov/ombudsman.



Federal Trade Commission

Bureau of Consumer Protection

Division of Consumer and Business Education

RULE 7.1: ADVERTISING

- (a) A lawyer or law firm shall not use or disseminate or participate in the use or dissemination of any advertisement that:
 - (1) contains statements or claims that are false, deceptive or misleading; or
 - (2) violates a Rule.
- (b) Subject to the provisions of paragraph (a), an advertisement may include information as to:
 - (1) legal and nonlegal education; degrees and other scholastic distinctions; dates of admission to any bar; areas of the law in which the lawyer or law firm practices, as authorized by these Rules; public offices and teaching positions held; publications of law-related matters authored by the lawyer; memberships in bar associations or other professional societies or organizations, including offices and committee assignments therein; foreign language fluency; and bona fide professional ratings;
 - (2) names of clients regularly represented, provided that the client has given prior written consent;
 - (3) bank references; credit arrangements accepted; prepaid or group legal services programs in which the lawyer or law firm participates; nonlegal services provided by the lawyer or law firm or by an entity owned and controlled by the lawyer or law firm; the existence of contractual relationships between the lawyer or law firm and a nonlegal professional or nonlegal professional service firm, to the extent permitted by Rule 5.8, and the nature and extent of services available through those contractual relationships; and
 - (4) legal fees for initial consultation; contingent fee rates in civil matters, when accompanied by a statement disclosing the information required by paragraph (p); range of fees for legal and nonlegal services, provided that there be available to the public free of charge a written statement clearly describing the scope of each advertised service, hourly rates, and fixed fees for specified legal and nonlegal services.

(c) An advertisement shall not:

- (1) include a paid endorsement of, or testimonial about, a lawyer or law firm without disclosing that the person is being compensated therefor;
- (2) include the portrayal of a fictitious law firm, the use of a fictitious name to refer to lawyers not associated together in a law firm, or otherwise imply that lawyers are associated in a law firm if that is not the case;

- (3) use actors to portray a judge, the lawyer, members of the law firm, or clients, or utilize depictions of fictionalized events or scenes, without disclosure of same;
 - (4) be made to resemble legal documents.
- (d) An advertisement that complies with paragraph (e) may contain the following:
 - (1) statements that are reasonably likely to create an expectation about results the lawyer can achieve;
 - (2) statements that compare the lawyer's services with the services of other lawyers;
 - (3) testimonials or endorsements of clients, and of former clients; or
 - (4) statements describing or characterizing the quality of the lawyer's or law firm's services.
- (e) It is permissible to provide the information set forth in paragraph (d) provided:
 - (1) its dissemination does not violate paragraph (a);
 - (2) it can be factually supported by the lawyer or law firm as of the date on which the advertisement is published or disseminated; and
 - (3) it is accompanied by the following disclaimer: "Prior results do not guarantee a similar outcome"; and
 - (4) in the case of a testimonial or endorsement from a client with respect to a matter still pending, the client gives informed consent confirmed in writing.
- (f) Every advertisement other than those appearing in a radio, television or billboard advertisement, in a directory, newspaper, magazine or other periodical (and any web sites related thereto), or made in person pursuant to Rule 7.3(a)(1), shall be labeled "Attorney Advertising" on the first page, or on the home page in the case of a web site. If the communication is in the form of a self-mailing brochure or postcard, the words "Attorney Advertising" shall appear therein. In the case of electronic mail, the subject line shall contain the notation "ATTORNEY ADVERTISING."
- (g) A lawyer or law firm shall not utilize meta-tags or other hidden computer codes that, if displayed, would violate these Rules.
- (h) All advertisements shall include the name, principal law office address and telephone number of the lawyer or law firm whose services are being offered.

- (i) Any words or statements required by this Rule to appear in an advertisement must be clearly legible and capable of being read by the average person, if written, and intelligible if spoken aloud. In the case of a web site, the required words or statements shall appear on the home page.
- (j) A lawyer or law firm advertising any fixed fee for specified legal services shall, at the time of fee publication, have available to the public a written statement clearly describing the scope of each advertised service, which statement shall be available to the client at the time of retainer for any such service. Such legal services shall include all those services that are recognized as reasonable and necessary under local custom in the area of practice in the community where the services are performed.
- (k) All advertisements shall be pre-approved by the lawyer or law firm, and a copy shall be retained for a period of not less than three years following its initial dissemination. Any advertisement contained in a computer-accessed communication shall be retained for a period of not less than one year. A copy of the contents of any web site covered by this Rule shall be preserved upon the initial publication of the web site, any major web site redesign, or a meaningful and extensive content change, but in no event less frequently than once every 90 days.
- (l) If a lawyer or law firm advertises a range of fees or an hourly rate for services, the lawyer or law firm shall not charge more than the fee advertised for such services. If a lawyer or law firm advertises a fixed fee for specified legal services, or performs services described in a fee schedule, the lawyer or law firm shall not charge more than the fixed fee for such stated legal service as set forth in the advertisement or fee schedule, unless the client agrees in writing that the services performed or to be performed were not legal services referred to or implied in the advertisement or in the fee schedule and, further, that a different fee arrangement shall apply to the transaction.
- (m) Unless otherwise specified in the advertisement, if a lawyer publishes any fee information authorized under this Rule in a publication that is published more frequently than once per month, the lawyer shall be bound by any representation made therein for a period of not less than 30 days after such publication. If a lawyer publishes any fee information authorized under this Rule in a publication that is published once per month or less frequently, the lawyer shall be bound by any representation made therein until the publication of the succeeding issue. If a lawyer publishes any fee information authorized under this Rule in a publication that has no fixed date for publication of a succeeding issue, the lawyer shall be bound by any representation made therein for a reasonable period of time after publication, but in no event less than 90 days.
- (n) Unless otherwise specified, if a lawyer broadcasts any fee information authorized under this Rule, the lawyer shall be bound by any representation made therein for a period of not less than 30 days after such broadcast.
- (o) A lawyer shall not compensate or give anything of value to representatives of the press, radio, television or other communication medium in anticipation of or in return for professional publicity in a news item.

- (p) All advertisements that contain information about the fees charged by the lawyer or law firm, including those indicating that in the absence of a recovery no fee will be charged, shall comply with the provisions of Judiciary Law § 488(3).
- (q) A lawyer may accept employment that results from participation in activities designed to educate the public to recognize legal problems, to make intelligent selection of counsel or to utilize available legal services.
- (r) Without affecting the right to accept employment, a lawyer may speak publicly or write for publication on legal topics so long as the lawyer does not undertake to give individual advice.

Comment

Advertising

- [1] The need of members of the public for legal services is met only if they recognize their legal problems, appreciate the importance of seeking assistance, and are able to obtain the services of competent legal counsel. Hence, important functions of the legal profession are to educate people to recognize their problems, to facilitate the process of intelligent selection of lawyers, and to assist in making legal services fully available.
- [2] The public's need to know about legal services can be fulfilled in part through advertising. People of limited means who have not made extensive use of legal services in many instances rely on advertising to find appropriate counsel. While a lawyer's reputation may attract some clients, lawyers may also make the public aware of their services by advertising to obtain work.
- [3] Advertising by lawyers serves two principal purposes: first, it educates potential clients regarding their need for legal advice and assists them in obtaining a lawyer appropriate for those needs. Second, it enables lawyers to attract clients. To carry out these two purposes and because of the critical importance of legal services, it is of the utmost importance that lawyer advertising not be false, deceptive or misleading. Truthful statements that are misleading are prohibited by this Rule. A truthful statement is misleading if it omits a fact necessary to make the lawyer's communication, considered as a whole, not materially misleading. A truthful statement is also misleading if there is a substantial likelihood that it will lead a reasonable person to formulate a specific conclusion about the lawyer or the lawyer's services, or about the results a lawyer can achieve, for which there is no reasonable factual foundation. For example, a lawyer might truthfully state, "I have never lost a case," but that statement would be misleading if the lawyer settled virtually all cases that the lawyer handled. A communication to anyone that states or implies that the lawyer has the ability to influence improperly a court, court officer, governmental agency or government official is improper under Rule 8.4(e).
- [4] To be effective, advertising must attract the attention of viewers, readers or recipients and convey its content in ways that will be understandable and helpful to them. Lawyers may therefore use advertising techniques intended to attract attention, such as music, sound effects, graphics and the like, so long as those techniques do not render the advertisement false, deceptive or misleading. Lawyer advertising may use actors or fictionalized events or

scenes for this purpose, provided appropriate disclosure of their use is made. Some images or techniques, however, are highly likely to be misleading. So, for instance, legal advertising should not be made to resemble legal documents.

- [5] The "Attorney Advertising" label serves to dispel any confusion or concern that might be created when nonlawyers receive letters or emails from lawyers. The label is not necessary for advertising in newspapers or on television, or similar communications that are self-evidently advertisements, such as billboards or press releases transmitted to news outlets, and as to which there is no risk of such confusion or concern. The ultimate purpose of the label is to inform readers where they might otherwise be confused.
- Not all communications made by lawyers about the lawyer or the law firm's services are advertising. Advertising by lawyers consists of communications made in any form about the lawyer or the law firm's services, the primary purpose of which is retention of the lawyer or law firm for pecuniary gain as a result of the communication. However, noncommercial communications motivated by a not-for-profit organization's interest in political expression and association are generally not considered advertising. Of course, all communications by lawyers, whether subject to the special rules governing lawyer advertising or not, are governed by the general rule that lawyers may not engage in conduct involving dishonesty, fraud, deceit or misrepresentation, or knowingly make a material false statement of fact or law. By definition, communications to existing clients are excluded from the Rules governing advertising. A client who is a current client in any matter is an existing client for all purposes of these Rules. (Whether a client is a current client for purposes of conflicts of interest and other issues may depend on other considerations. Generally, the term "current client" for purposes of the advertising exemption should be interpreted more broadly than it is for determining whether a client is a "current client" for purposes of a conflict of interest analysis.)
- [7] Communications to former clients that are germane to the earlier representation are not considered to be advertising. Likewise, communications to other lawyers, including those made in bar association publications and other publications targeted primarily at lawyers, are excluded from the special rules governing lawyer advertising even if their purpose is the retention of the lawyer or law firm. Topical newsletters, client alerts, or blogs intended to educate recipients about new developments in the law are generally not considered advertising. However, a newsletter, client alert, or blog that provides information or news primarily about the lawyer or law firm (for example, the lawyer or law firm's cases, personnel, clients or achievements) generally would be considered advertising. Communications, such as proposed retainer agreements or ordinary correspondence with a prospective client who has expressed interest in, and requested information about, a lawyer's services, are not advertising. Accordingly, the special restrictions on advertising and solicitation would not apply to a lawyer's response to a prospective client who has asked the lawyer to outline the lawyer's qualifications to undertake a proposed retention or the terms of a potential retention.
- [8] The circulation or distribution to prospective clients by a lawyer of an article or report published about the lawyer by a third party is advertising if the lawyer's primary purpose is to obtain retentions. In circulating or distributing such materials the lawyer should include information or disclaimers as necessary to dispel any misconceptions to which the article may give rise. For example, if a lawyer circulates an article discussing the lawyer's successes that is

reasonably likely to create an expectation about the results the lawyer will achieve in future cases, a disclaimer is required by paragraph (e)(3). If the article contains misinformation about the lawyer's qualifications, any circulation of the article by the lawyer should make any necessary corrections or qualifications. This may be necessary even when the article included misinformation through no fault of the lawyer or because the article is out of date, so that material information that was true at the time is no longer true. Some communications by a law firm that may constitute marketing or branding are not necessarily advertisements. For example, pencils, legal pads, greeting cards, coffee mugs, T-shirts or the like with the law firm name, logo, and contact information printed on them do not constitute "advertisements" within the definition of this Rule if their primary purpose is general awareness and branding, rather than the retention of the law firm for a particular matter.

Recognition of Legal Problems

- [9] The legal professional should help the public to recognize legal problems because such problems may not be self-revealing and might not be timely noticed. Therefore, lawyers should encourage and participate in educational and public-relations programs concerning the legal system, with particular reference to legal problems that frequently arise. A lawyer's participation in an educational program is ordinarily not considered to be advertising because its primary purpose is to educate and inform rather than to attract clients. Such a program might be considered to be advertising if, in addition to its educational component, participants or recipients are expressly encouraged to hire the lawyer or law firm. A lawyer who writes or speaks for the purpose of educating members of the public to recognize their legal problems should carefully refrain from giving or appearing to give a general solution applicable to all apparently similar individual problems, because slight changes in fact situations may require a material variance in the applicable advice; otherwise, the public may be misled and misadvised. Talks and writings by lawyers for nonlawyers should caution them not to attempt to solve individual problems on the basis of the information contained therein.
- [10] As members of their communities, lawyers may choose to sponsor or contribute to cultural, sporting, charitable or other events organized by not-for-profit organizations. If information about the lawyer or law firm disseminated in connection with such an event is limited to the identification of the lawyer or law firm, the lawyer's or law firm's contact information, a brief description of areas of practice, and the fact of sponsorship or contribution, the communication is not considered advertising.

Statements Creating Expectations, Characterizations of Quality, and Comparisons

[11] Lawyer advertising may include statements that are reasonably likely to create an expectation about results the lawyer can achieve, statements that compare the lawyer's services with the services of other lawyers, or statements describing or characterizing the quality of the lawyer's or law firm's services, only if they can be factually supported by the lawyer or law firm as of the date on which the advertisement is published or disseminated and are accompanied by the following disclaimer: "Prior results do not guarantee a similar outcome." Accordingly, if true and accompanied by the disclaimer, a lawyer or law firm could advertise "Our firm won 10 jury verdicts over \$1,000,000 in the last five years," "We have more Patent Lawyers than any other firm in X County," or "I have been practicing in the area of divorce law for more than 10

years." Even true factual statements may be misleading if presented out of the context of additional information needed to properly understand and evaluate the statements. For example, a truthful statement by a lawyer that the lawyer's average jury verdict for a given year was \$100,000 may be misleading if that average was based on a large number of very small verdicts and one \$10,000,000 verdict. Likewise, advertising that truthfully recites judgment amounts would be misleading if the lawyer failed to disclose that the judgments described were overturned on appeal or were obtained by default.

[12] Descriptions of characteristics of the lawyer or law firm that are not comparative and do not involve results obtained are permissible even though they cannot be factually supported. Such statements are understood to be general descriptions and not claims about quality, and would not be likely to mislead potential clients. Accordingly, a law firm could advertise that it is "Hard-Working," "Dedicated," or "Compassionate" without the necessity to provide factual support for such subjective claims. On the other hand, descriptions of characteristics of the law firm that compare its services with those of other law firms and that are not susceptible of being factually supported could be misleading to potential clients. Accordingly, a lawyer may not advertise that the lawyer is the "Best," "Most Experienced," or "Hardest Working." Similarly, some claims that involve results obtained are not susceptible of being factually supported and could be misleading to potential clients. Accordingly, a law firm may not advertise that it will obtain "Big \$\$\$," "Most Money," or "We Win Big."

Bona Fide Professional Ratings

[13] An advertisement may include information regarding bona fide professional ratings by referring to the rating service and how it has rated the lawyer, provided that the advertisement contains the "past results" disclaimer as required under paragraphs (d) and (e). However, a rating is not "bona fide" unless it is unbiased and nondiscriminatory. Thus, it must evaluate lawyers based on objective criteria or legitimate peer review in a manner unbiased by the rating service's economic interests (such as payment to the rating service by the rated lawyer) and not subject to improper influence by lawyers who are being evaluated. Further, the rating service must fairly consider all lawyers within the pool of those who are purported to be covered. For example, a rating service that purports to evaluate all lawyers practicing in a particular geographic area or in a particular area of practice or of a particular age must apply its criteria to all lawyers within that geographic area, practice area, or age group.

Meta-Tags

[14] Meta-tags are hidden computer software codes that direct certain Internet search engines to the web site of a lawyer or law firm. For example, if a lawyer places the meta-tag "NY personal injury specialist" on the lawyer's web site, then a person who enters the search term "personal injury specialist" into a search engine will be directed to that lawyer's web page. That particular meta-tag is prohibited because Rule 7.4(a) generally prohibits the use of the word "specialist." However, a lawyer may use an advertisement employing meta-tags or other hidden computer codes that, if displayed, would not violate a Rule.

Advertisements Referring to Fees and Advances

[15] All advertisements that contain information about the fees or expenses charged by the lawyer or law firm, including advertisements indicating that in the absence of a recovery no fee will be charged, must comply with the provisions of section 488(3) of the Judiciary Law. However, a lawyer or law firm that offers any of the fee and expense arrangements permitted by section 488(3) must not, either directly or in any advertisement, state or imply that the lawyer's or law firm's ability to advance or pay costs and expenses of litigation is unique or extraordinary when that is not the case. For example, if an advertisement promises that the lawyer or law firm will advance the costs and expenses of litigation contingent on the outcome of the matter, or promises that the lawyer or law firm will pay the costs and expenses of litigation for indigent clients, then the advertisement must not say that such arrangements are "unique in the area," "unlike other firms," available "only at our firm," "extraordinary," or words to that effect, unless that is actually the case. However, if the lawyer or law firm can objectively demonstrate that this arrangement is unique or extraordinary, then the lawyer or law firm may make such a claim in the advertisement.

Retention of Copies; Filing of Copies; Designation of Principal Office

- [16] Where these Rules require that a lawyer retain a copy of an advertisement or file a copy of a solicitation or other information, that obligation may be satisfied by any of the following: original records, photocopies, microfilm, optical imaging, and any other medium that preserves an image of the document that cannot be altered without detection.
- [17] A law firm that has no office it considers its principal office may comply with paragraph (h) by listing one or more offices where a substantial amount of the law firm's work is performed.

RULE 7.3: SOLICITATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF PROFESSIONAL EMPLOYMENT

- (a) A lawyer shall not engage in solicitation:
- (1) by in-person or telephone contact, or by real-time or interactive computer-accessed communication unless the recipient is a close friend, relative, former client or existing client; or
 - (2) by any form of communication if:
 - (i) the communication or contact violates Rule 4.5, Rule 7.1(a), or paragraph (e) of this Rule;
 - (ii) the recipient has made known to the lawyer a desire not to be solicited by the lawyer;
 - (iii) the solicitation involves coercion, duress or harassment;
 - (iv) the lawyer knows or reasonably should know that the age or the physical, emotional or mental state of the recipient makes it unlikely that the recipient will be able to exercise reasonable judgment in retaining a lawyer; or
 - (v) the lawyer intends or expects, but does not disclose, that the legal services necessary to handle the matter competently will be performed primarily by another lawyer who is not affiliated with the soliciting lawyer as a partner, associate or of counsel.
- (b) For purposes of this Rule, "solicitation" means any advertisement initiated by or on behalf of a lawyer or law firm that is directed to, or targeted at, a specific recipient or group of recipients, or their family members or legal representatives, the primary purpose of which is the retention of the lawyer or law firm, and a significant motive for which is pecuniary gain. It does not include a proposal or other writing prepared and delivered in response to a specific request of a prospective client.
- (c) A solicitation directed to a recipient in this State shall be subject to the following provisions:
 - (1) A copy of the solicitation shall at the time of its dissemination be filed with the attorney disciplinary committee of the judicial district or judicial department wherein the lawyer or law firm maintains its principal office. Where no such office is maintained, the filing shall be made in the judicial department where the solicitation is targeted. A filing shall consist of:
 - (i) a copy of the solicitation;

- (ii) a transcript of the audio portion of any radio or television solicitation; and
- (iii) if the solicitation is in a language other than English, an accurate English-language translation.
- (2) Such solicitation shall contain no reference to the fact of filing.
- (3) If a solicitation is directed to a predetermined recipient, a list containing the names and addresses of all recipients shall be retained by the lawyer or law firm for a period of not less than three years following the last date of its dissemination.
- (4) Solicitations filed pursuant to this subdivision shall be open to public inspection.
 - (5) The provisions of this paragraph shall not apply to:
 - (i) a solicitation directed or disseminated to a close friend, relative, or former or existing client;
 - (ii) a web site maintained by the lawyer or law firm, unless the web site is designed for and directed to or targeted at a prospective client affected by an identifiable actual event or occurrence or by an identifiable prospective defendant; or
 - (iii) professional cards or other announcements the distribution of which is authorized by Rule 7.5(a).
- (d) A written solicitation shall not be sent by a method that requires the recipient to travel to a location other than that at which the recipient ordinarily receives business or personal mail or that requires a signature on the part of the recipient.
- (e) No solicitation relating to a specific incident involving potential claims for personal injury or wrongful death shall be disseminated before the 30th day after the date of the incident, unless a filing must be made within 30 days of the incident as a legal prerequisite to the particular claim, in which case no unsolicited communication shall be made before the 15th day after the date of the incident.
- (f) Any solicitation made in writing or by computer-accessed communication and directed to a pre-determined recipient, if prompted by a specific occurrence involving or affecting a recipient, shall disclose how the lawyer obtained the identity of the recipient and learned of the recipient's potential legal need.
- (g) If a retainer agreement is provided with any solicitation, the top of each page shall be marked "SAMPLE" in red ink in a type size equal to the largest type size used in

the agreement and the words "DO NOT SIGN" shall appear on the client signature line.

- (h) Any solicitation covered by this section shall include the name, principal law office address and telephone number of the lawyer or law firm whose services are being offered.
- (i) The provisions of this Rule shall apply to a lawyer or members of a law firm not admitted to practice in this State who shall solicit retention by residents of this State.

Comment

Solicitation

- [1] In addition to seeking clients through general advertising (either by public communications in the media or by private communications to potential clients who are neither current clients nor other lawyers), many lawyers attempt to attract clients through a specialized category of advertising called "solicitation." Not all advertisements are solicitations within the meaning of this Rule. All solicitations, however, are advertisements with certain additional characteristics. By definition, a communication that is not an advertisement is not a solicitation. Solicitations are subject to all of the Rules governing advertising and are also subject to additional Rules, including filing a copy of the solicitation with the appropriate attorney disciplinary authority (including a transcript of the audio portion of any radio or television solicitation and, if the solicitation is in a language other than English, an accurate English language translation). These and other additional requirements will facilitate oversight by disciplinary authorities.
- [2] A "solicitation" means any advertisement: (i) that is initiated by a lawyer or law firm (as opposed to a communication made in response to an inquiry initiated by a potential client), (ii) with a primary purpose of persuading recipients to retain the lawyer or law firm (as opposed to providing educational information about the law, *see* Rule 7.1, Comment [7]), (iii) that has as a significant motive for the lawyer to make money (as opposed to a public-interest lawyer offering pro bono services), and (iv) that is directed to or targeted at a specific recipient or group of recipients, or their family members or legal representatives. Any advertisement that meets all four of these criteria is a solicitation, and is governed not only by the Rules that govern all advertisements but also by special Rules governing solicitation.

Directed or Targeted

[3] An advertisement may be considered to be directed to or targeted at a specific recipient or recipients in two different ways. First, an advertisement is considered "directed to or targeted at" a specific recipient or recipients if it is made by in-person or telephone contact or by real-time or interactive computer-accessed communication or if it is addressed so that it will be delivered to the specific recipient or recipients or their families or agents (as with letters, emails, express packages). Advertisements made by in-person or telephone contact or by real-time or interactive computer-accessed communication are prohibited unless the recipient is a close friend, relative, former client or current client. Advertisements addressed so that they will be delivered to the specific recipient or recipients or their families or agents (as with letters, emails,

express packages) are subject to various additional rules governing solicitation (including filing and public inspection) because otherwise they would not be readily subject to disciplinary oversight and review. Second, an advertisement in public media such as newspapers, television, billboards, web sites or the like is a solicitation if it makes reference to a specific person or group of people whose legal needs arise out of a specific incident to which the advertisement explicitly refers. The term "specific incident" is explained in Comment [5].

[4] Unless it falls within Comment [3], an advertisement in public media such as newspapers, television, billboards, web sites or the like is presumed not to be directed to or targeted at a specific recipient or recipients. For example, an advertisement in a public medium is not directed to or targeted at "a specific recipient or group of recipients" simply because it is intended to attract potential clients with needs in a specified area of law. Thus, a lawyer could advertise in the local newspaper that the lawyer is available to assist homeowners in reducing property tax assessments. Likewise, an advertisement by a patent lawyer is not directed or targeted within the meaning of the definition solely because the magazine is geared toward inventors. Similarly, a lawyer could advertise on television or in a newspaper or web site to the general public that the lawyer practices in the area of personal injury or Workers' Compensation law. The fact that some recipients of such advertisements might actually be in need of specific legal services at the time of the communication does not transform such advertisements into solicitations.

Solicitations Relating To a Specific Incident Involving Potential Claims for Personal Injury or Wrongful Death

- [5] Solicitations relating to a specific incident involving potential claims for personal injury or wrongful death are subject to a further restriction, in that they may not be disseminated until 30 days (or in some cases 15 days) after the date of the incident. This restriction applies even where the recipient is a close friend, relative, or former client, but not where the recipient is a current client. A "specific incident" is a particular identifiable event (or a sequence of related events occurring at approximately the same time and place) that causes harm to one or more people. Specific incidents include such events as traffic accidents, plane or train crashes, explosions, building collapses, and the like.
- [6] A solicitation that is intended to attract potential claims for personal injury or wrongful death arising from a common cause but at disparate times and places, does not relate to a specific incident and is not subject to the special 30-day (or 15-day) rule, even though it is addressed so that it will be delivered to specific recipients or their families or agents (as with letters, emails, express packages), or is made in a public medium such as newspapers, television, billboards, web sites or the like and makes reference to a specific person or group of people, *see* Comments [3]-[4]. For example, solicitations intended to be of interest only to potential claimants injured over a period of years by a defective medical device or medication do not relate to a specific incident and are not subject to the special 30-day (or 15-day) rule.
- [7] An advertisement in the public media that makes no express reference to a specific incident does not become a solicitation subject to the 30-day (or 15-day) rule solely because a specific incident has occurred within the last 30 (or 15) days. Thus, a law firm that advertises on television or in newspapers that it can "help injured people explore their legal

rights" is not violating the 30-day (or 15-day) rule by running or continuing to run its advertisements even though a mass disaster injured many people within hours or days before the advertisement appeared. Unless an advertisement in the public media explicitly refers to a specific incident, it is not a solicitation subject to the 30-day (or 15-day) blackout period. However, if a lawyer causes an advertisement to be delivered (whether by mail, email, express service, courier, or any other form of direct delivery) to a specific recipient (i) with knowledge that the addressee is either a person killed or injured in a specific incident or that person's family member or agent, and (ii) with the intent to communicate with that person because of that knowledge, then the advertisement is a solicitation subject to the 30-day (or 15-day) rule even if it makes no reference to a specific incident and even if it is part of a mass mailing.

Extraterritorial Application of Solicitation Rules

[8] All of the special solicitation rules, including the special 30-day (or 15-day) rule, apply to solicitations directed to recipients in New York State, whether made by a lawyer admitted in New York State or a lawyer admitted in any another jurisdiction. Solicitations by a lawyer admitted in New York State directed to or targeted at a recipient or recipients outside of New York State are not subject to the filing and related requirements set out in Rule 7.3(c). Whether such solicitations are subject to the special 30-day (or 15-day) rule depends on the application of Rule 8.5.

In-Person, Telephone and Real-Time or Interactive Computer-Accessed Communication

Paragraph (a) generally prohibits in-person solicitation, which has historically [9] been disfavored by the bar because it poses serious dangers to potential clients. For example, inperson solicitation poses the risk that a lawyer, who is trained in the arts of advocacy and persuasion, may pressure a potential client to hire the lawyer without adequate consideration. These same risks are present in telephone contact or in real-time or interactive computeraccessed communication. These same risks are also present in all other real-time or interactive electronic communications, whether by computer, phone or related electronic means – see Rule 1.0(c) (defining "computer-accessed communication") – and are regulated in the same manner. The prohibitions on in-person or telephone contact and the prohibitions on contact by real-time or interactive computer-accessed communication do not apply if the recipient is a close friend, relative, former or current client. Communications with these individuals do not pose the same dangers as solicitations to others. However, when the special 30-day (or 15-day) rule applies, it does so even where the recipient is a close friend, relative, or former client. Ordinarily, email communications and web sites are not considered to be real-time or interactive communication. Similarly, automated pop-up advertisements on a web site that are not a live response are not considered to be real-time or interactive communication. However, instant messaging ("IM"), chat rooms, and other similar types of conversational computer-accessed communications whether sent or received via a desktop computer, a portable computer, a cell phone, or any similar electronic or wireless device, and whether sent directly or via social media - are considered to be real-time or interactive communication.

RULE 7.4: IDENTIFICATION OF PRACTICE AND SPECIALTY

- (a) A lawyer or law firm may publicly identify one or more areas of law in which the lawyer or the law firm practices, or may state that the practice of the lawyer or law firm is limited to one or more areas of law, provided that the lawyer or law firm shall not state that the lawyer or law firm is a specialist or specializes in a particular field of law, except as provided in Rule 7.4(c).
- (b) A lawyer admitted to engage in patent practice before the United States Patent and Trademark Office may use the designation "Patent Attorney" or a substantially similar designation.
- (c) A lawyer may state that the lawyer has been recognized or certified as a specialist only as follows:
 - (1) A lawyer who is certified as a specialist in a particular area of law or law practice by a private organization approved for that purpose by the American Bar Association may state the fact of certification if, in conjunction therewith, the certifying organization is identified and the following statement is prominently made: This certification is not granted by any governmental authority."
 - (2) A lawyer who is certified as a specialist in a particular area of law or law practice by the authority having jurisdiction over specialization under the laws of another state or territory may state the fact of certification if, in conjunction therewith, the certifying state or territory is identified and the following statement is prominently made: "This certification is not granted by any governmental authority within the State of New York."

(3) A statement is prominently made if:

- (i) when written, it is clearly legible and capable of being read by the average person, and is in a font size at least two font sizes larger than the largest text used to state the fact of certification; and
- (ii) when spoken aloud, it is intelligible to the average person, and is at a cadence no faster, and a level of audibility no lower, than the cadence and level of audibility used to state the fact of certification.

Comment

- [1] Paragraph (a) permits a lawyer to indicate areas of practice in which the lawyer practices, or that his or her practice is limited to those areas.
- [2] Paragraph (b) recognizes the long-established policy of the Patent and Trademark Office for the designation of lawyers practicing before the Office.

[3] Paragraph (c) permits a lawyer to state that the lawyer specializes or is certified as a specialist in a field of law if such certification is granted by an organization approved or accredited by the American Bar Association or by the authority having jurisdiction over specialization under the laws of another jurisdiction provided that the name of the certifying organization or authority must be included in any communication regarding the certification together with the disclaimer required by paragraph (c).

RULE 7.5: PROFESSIONAL NOTICES, LETTERHEADS AND SIGNS

- (a) A lawyer or law firm may use internet web sites, professional cards, professional announcement cards, office signs, letterheads or similar professional notices or devices, provided the same do not violate any statute or court rule and are in accordance with Rule 7.1, including the following:
 - (1) a professional card of a lawyer identifying the lawyer by name and as a lawyer, and giving addresses, telephone numbers, the name of the law firm, and any information permitted under Rule 7.1(b) or Rule 7.4. A professional card of a law firm may also give the names of members and associates;
 - (2) a professional announcement card stating new or changed associations or addresses, change of firm name, or similar matters pertaining to the professional offices of a lawyer or law firm or any nonlegal business conducted by the lawyer or law firm pursuant to Rule 5.7. It may state biographical data, the names of members of the firm and associates, and the names and dates of predecessor firms in a continuing line of succession. It may state the nature of the legal practice if permitted under Rule 7.4;
 - (3) a sign in or near the office and in the building directory identifying the law office and any nonlegal business conducted by the lawyer or law firm pursuant to Rule 5.7. The sign may state the nature of the legal practice if permitted under Rule 7.4; or
 - (4) a letterhead identifying the lawyer by name and as a lawyer, and giving addresses, telephone numbers, the name of the law firm, associates and any information permitted under Rule 7.1(b) or Rule 7.4. A letterhead of a law firm may also give the names of members and associates, and names and dates relating to deceased and retired members. A lawyer or law firm may be designated "Of Counsel" on a letterhead if there is a continuing relationship with a lawyer or law firm, other than as a partner or associate. A lawyer or law firm may be designated as "General Counsel" or by similar professional reference on stationery of a client if the lawyer or the firm devotes a substantial amount of professional time in the representation of that client. The letterhead of a law firm may give the names and dates of predecessor firms in a continuing line of succession.
- (b) A lawyer in private practice shall not practice under a trade name, a name that is misleading as to the identity of the lawyer or lawyers practicing under such name, or a firm name containing names other than those of one or more of the lawyers in the firm, except that the name of a professional corporation shall contain "PC" or such symbols permitted by law, the name of a limited liability company or partnership shall contain "LLC," "LLP" or such symbols permitted by law and, if otherwise lawful, a firm may use as, or continue to include in its name the name or names of one or more deceased or retired members of the firm or of a predecessor firm in a continuing line of succession. Such terms as "legal clinic," "legal aid," "legal service office," "legal assistance office," "defender

office" and the like may be used only by qualified legal assistance organizations, except that the term "legal clinic" may be used by any lawyer or law firm provided the name of a participating lawyer or firm is incorporated therein. A lawyer or law firm may not include the name of a nonlawyer in its firm name, nor may a lawyer or law firm that has a contractual relationship with a nonlegal professional or nonlegal professional service firm pursuant to Rule 5.8 to provide legal and other professional services on a systematic and continuing basis include in its firm name the name of the nonlegal professional service firm or any individual nonlegal professional affiliated therewith. A lawyer who assumes a judicial, legislative or public executive or administrative post or office shall not permit the lawyer's name to remain in the name of a law firm or to be used in professional notices of the firm during any significant period in which the lawyer is not actively and regularly practicing law as a member of the firm and, during such period, other members of the firm shall not use the lawyer's name in the firm name or in professional notices of the firm.

- (c) Lawyers shall not hold themselves out as having a partnership with one or more other lawyers unless they are in fact partners.
- (d) A partnership shall not be formed or continued between or among lawyers licensed in different jurisdictions unless all enumerations of the members and associates of the firm on its letterhead and in other permissible listings make clear the jurisdictional limitations on those members and associates of the firm not licensed to practice in all listed jurisdictions; however, the same firm name may be used in each jurisdiction.
- (e) A lawyer or law firm may utilize a domain name for an internet web site that does not include the name of the lawyer or law firm provided:
 - (1) all pages of the web site clearly and conspicuously include the actual name of the lawyer or law firm;
 - (2) the lawyer or law firm in no way attempts to engage in the practice of law using the domain name;
 - (3) the domain name does not imply an ability to obtain results in a matter; and
 - (4) the domain name does not otherwise violate these Rules.
- (f) A lawyer or law firm may utilize a telephone number which contains a domain name, nickname, moniker or motto that does not otherwise violate these Rules.

Comment

Professional Status

[1] In order to avoid the possibility of misleading persons with whom a lawyer deals, a lawyer should be scrupulous in the representation of professional status. Lawyers should not hold themselves out as being partners or associates of a law firm if that is not the fact, and thus

lawyers should not hold themselves out as being a partners or associates if they only share offices.

Trade Names and Domain Names

A lawyer may not practice under a trade name. Many law firms have created Internet web sites to provide information about their firms. A web site is reached through an Internet address, commonly called a "domain name." As long as a law firm's name complies with other Rules, it is always proper for a law firm to use its own name or its initials or some abbreviation or variation of its own name as its domain name. For example, the law firm of Able and Baker may use the domain name www.ableandbaker.com, or www.ab.com, or www.able.com, or www.ablelaw.com. However, to make domain names easier for clients and potential clients to remember and to locate, some law firms may prefer to use terms other than the law firm's name. If Able and Baker practices real estate law, for instance, it may prefer a descriptive domain name such as www.realestatelaw.com or www.ablerealestatelaw.com or a colloquial domain name such as www.dirtlawyers.com. Accordingly, a law firm may utilize a domain name for an Internet web site that does not include the name of the law firm, provided the domain name meets four conditions: First, all pages of the web site created by the law firm must clearly and conspicuously include the actual name of the law firm. Second, the law firm must in no way attempt to engage in the practice of law using the domain name. This restriction is parallel to the general prohibition against the use of trade names. For example, if Able and Baker uses the domain name www.realestatelaw.com, the firm may not advertise that people buying or selling homes should "contact www.realestatelaw.com" unless the firm also clearly and conspicuously includes the name of the law firm in the advertisement. Third, the domain name must not imply an ability to obtain results in a matter. For example, a personal injury firm could not use the domain name www.win-your-case.com or www.settle-for-more.com because such names imply that the law firm can obtain favorable results in every matter regardless of the particular facts and circumstances. Fourth, the domain name must not otherwise violate a Rule. If a domain name meets the three criteria listed here but violates another Rule, then the domain name is improper under this Rule as well. For example, if Able and Baker are each solo practitioners who are not partners, they may not jointly establish a web site with the domain name www.ableandbaker.com because the lawyers would be holding themselves out as having a partnership when they are in fact not partners.

Telephone Numbers

- [3] Many lawyers and law firms use telephone numbers that spell words, because such telephone numbers are generally easier to remember than strings of numbers. As with domain names, lawyers and law firms may always properly use their own names, initials, or combinations of names, initials, numbers, and legal words as telephone numbers. For example, the law firm of Red & Blue may properly use phone numbers such as RED-BLUE, 4-RED-LAW, or RB-LEGAL.
- [4] Some lawyers and firms may instead (or in addition) wish to use telephone numbers that contain a domain name, nickname, moniker, or motto. A lawyer or law firm may use such telephone numbers as long as they do not violate any Rules, including those governing domain names. For example, a personal injury law firm may use the numbers 1-800-

ACCIDENT, 1-800-HURT-BAD, or 1-800-INJURY-LAW, but may not use the numbers 1-800-WINNERS, 1-800-2WIN-BIG, or 1-800-GET-CASH. (Phone numbers with more letters than the number of digits in a phone number are acceptable as long as the words do not violate a Rule.) *See* Rule 7.1, Comment [12].